

WOODROW WILSON

THE LIGHT WITHDRAWN

Extended Notes

7. Two Women

PAGE

- 77 *seven hundred*: WW to ELA and ELA to WW, September 18, 1883–June 21, 1885, *PWW*, vols. 2–4.
- 77 “*good motto*”: ELA to WW, February 4, 1884, *PWW*, 3:6. Wilson’s father had given him this same advice shortly after his 21st birthday: “dearest boy, do not allow yourself to dwell upon *yourself*.” Joseph Ruggles Wilson to WW, January 25, 1878, *PWW*, 1:345. Nonetheless, it would remain a lifelong habit.
- 77 “*a woman’s right*”: WW to ELA, March 1, 1885, *PWW*, 4:316.
- 77 “*wonderful sympathy*”: WW to ELA, March 31, 1885, *PWW*, 4:437.
- 78 “*to serve you*”: ELA to WW, March 6, 1885, *PWW*, 4:337.
- 78 *alarming letter*: ELA to WW, April 27, 1885, *PWW*, 4:532, 533–34.
- 78 “*desperate things*”: WW to ELA, April 28, 1885, *PWW*, 4:536–37.
- 78 “*patriarchal authority*”: Christopher Lasch, *The New Radicalism in America, 1889–1963: The Intellectual as a Social Type* (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1965), xiii.
- 78 *Scott’s chivalric novels*: Wilson continued to read and reread Scott throughout his life. WW “Index Rerum,” n.d. 1876, *PWW*, 1:108, 110; WW Shorthand Diary, June 10, 19, 1876, *PWW*, 1:137, 156n1; WW, “Culture and Education at the South” (unpublished article), March 29, 1883, *PWW*, 2:327; WW Inventory of Books, c. August 1, 1883, *PWW*, 2:402–04, 406 (partial list of WW’s Scott books); WW, “On an Author’s Choice of Company,” *Century Magazine*, vol. 51, no. 5 (March 1896), 775–779, at 777, in *PWW*, 9:342; WW to EAW, July 12, 1899, *PWW*, 11:163; *LL*, 1:36; William Allen White, *Woodrow Wilson: The Man, His Times, and His Task* (New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1924), 38, 307–08; A. Scott Berg, *Wilson* (New York: G.P. Putnam’s Sons, 2013), 35, 43, 49, 730. Ellen and the children read Scott as well. EAW to WW, July 25, 1894, *PWW*, 8:626 and n1; EAW to WW, July 10 and August 14, 1899, *PWW*, 11:160, 227 (Wilson children read Scott “devoutly”).
- 78 *influence of Scott’s works*: J.V. Ridgely, *Nineteenth-Century Southern Literature* (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 1980), 2, 32–49, 116; Hamilton James Eckenrode, “Sir Walter Scott and the South,” *North American Review*, vol. 206, no. 743 (October 1917), 595–603. Writing in dead earnest, Mark Twain blamed Scott’s “sham chivalries of a brainless and worthless long-vanished society” for the perpetuation of class and race distinctions in the South long after the Civil War. Scott, he alleged, did “more real and lasting harm, perhaps, than any other individual that ever wrote.” He contended that “Sir Walter disease, the character of the Southerner,” was “in great measure responsible for the [Civil] War.” Twain, *Life on the Mississippi*, Author’s National Edition (New York: Harper & Brothers, n.d.), 375–78.
- 79 “*neither her person nor her room*”: WW to ELA, April 15, 1884, *PWW*, 3:132.
- 79 “*no special effort*”: ELA to WW, November 8, 1884, *PWW*, 3:414.
- 79 “*I have given up*”: WW to ELA, February 19, 1885, *PWW*, 4:268. At the time, Johns Hopkins offered him the option of taking another year or two of classes and then sitting for the required examinations. WW to ELA, February 26, 1885, *PWW*, 4:299. But after that spring, Wilson never took another class at Johns Hopkins, or elsewhere.
- 79 *never to enroll again*: Stockton Axson, “*Brother Woodrow*”: *A Memoir of Woodrow Wilson*, ed. Arthur S. Link (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993), 57; W. Barksdale Maynard, *Woodrow Wilson: Princeton to the Presidency* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008), 30 (“Wilson never completed the requirements for the PhD [at] Johns Hopkins”).

- 79 *didn't need a Ph.D.*: Wilson shared his “coolest judgment in the matter” with his father, setting out 16 pages of pros and cons concluding it was best “not to try for it.” Based on that, his father agreed. Joseph Ruggles Wilson to WW, October 29, 1884, *PWW*, 3:385; WW to ELA, October 26 and November 8, 1884, *PWW*, 3:374, 414.
- 79 *only fifty-two citations ... years at Johns Hopkins*: Henry W. Bragdon, *Woodrow Wilson: The Academic Years* (Cambridge: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1967), 127; “Woodrow Wilson: The President’s Policies Analyzed in the Light of His Natural Inhibitions and His Past Record,” *The Nation*, vol. 103, no. 2672 (September 14, 1916), 256–58, at 258 (“it has been a matter of boast that he had but once casually visited the House of Representatives before he wrote *Congressional Government*”). According to Ray Stannard Baker, Wilson did not make his first visit to the Capitol until more than a year after he published *Congressional Government*. *LL*, 1:266. Wilson biographer John Milton Cooper determined that Wilson “would not set foot in the Capitol until 1898,” twelve years after receiving his doctorate. Cooper, *Woodrow Wilson: A Biography* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2009), 51.
- 79 *“no patience”*: WW to ELA, February 24, 1885, *PWW*, 4:286.
- 79 *panned it*: Bragdon, *Academic Years*, 135.
- 79 *Lowell*: Abbot Lawrence Lowell, “Ministerial Responsibility and the Constitution,” *Atlantic Monthly*, vol. 57, no. 340 (February 1886), 180–93.
- 80 *Equally forceful*: “Wilson’s Congressional Government,” *The Nation*, vol. 40, no. 1024 (February 12, 1885), 142–43; Bragdon, *Academic Years*, 135.
- 80 *take on his critics*: WW, “Responsible Government Under the Constitution,” *Atlantic Monthly*, vol. 57, no. 342 (April 1886), 542–553.
- 80 *introduction of legislation*: *Ibid.*, 552.
- 80 *high time*: WW to ELA, January 13, 1885, *PWW*, 3:603; Axson, *Brother Woodrow*, 58.
- 80 *parents had died*: Kristie Miller, *Ellen and Edith, Woodrow Wilson’s First Ladies* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2010), 7; Axson, *Brother Woodrow*, x.
- 80 *Like Woodrow’s father*: Ellen Axson’s grandfather, Isaac Stockton Keith Axson, preached as well as published his arguments in favor of the indefinite perpetuation of slavery. Larry E. Tise, *Proslavery: A History of the Defense of Slavery in America, 1701–1840* (Athens, GA: University of Georgia Press, 1987), 363. As a pastor during the Civil War, he conducted prayer meetings for the success of the Confederate government. John Rozier, ed., *The Granite Farm Letters: The Civil War Correspondence of Edgeworth & Sallie Bird* (Athens, GA: University of Georgia Press, 1988), 60. For Wilson’s father’s views on slavery, see text at 19–20.
- 80 *the very resort*: A travel guide of the era described the Arden Park Lodge in North Carolina’s Great Smoky Mountains as “an excellent hotel largely patronized by exclusive guests from the cotton and cane States.” North Carolina State Board of Agriculture, *North Carolina and Its Resources* (Raleigh, NC: M.I. & J.C. Stewart, 1896), 294.
- 81 *“advanced women”*: Frank Parker Stockbridge to Ray Stannard Baker, December 11, 1927, Ray Stannard Baker Papers, reel 83, Manuscript Collection, Library of Congress.
- 81 *“meddled”*: Edith Finch, *Carey Thomas of Bryn Mawr* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1947), 175.
- 81 *“co-educational institution”*: WW to ELA, November 30, 1884, *PWW*, 3:499.
- 81 *“I hate the place”*: WW to ELA, October 4, 1887, *PWW*, 5:605.
- 81 *In Pennsylvania alone*: The University of Northern Pennsylvania began admitting women in 1850, followed by Waynesburg College, 1851; Westminster College, 1852; Penn Medical College, 1853; Mount Pleasant College, 1855; Westmoreland College, 1862; Swarthmore, 1862; Lebanon Valley College, 1866; Lambeth College, 1868, Cherry Tree Male and Female College, 1868; Thiel College, 1869; African College, 1869; Monongahela College, 1869; Juniata College, 1870; Agricultural College of Pennsylvania (Pennsylvania State University), 1871; and Grove City College, 1884. Saul Sack, “The Higher Education of Women in Pennsylvania,” *Pennsylvania Magazine of History and Biography*, vol. 83, no. 1 (January 1959), 29–73, at 37–39.
- 81 *She preferred*: Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 57.
- 81 *academic star ... Sorbonne*: Helen Lefkowitz Horowitz, *Alma Mater: Design and Experience in the Women’s Colleges from Their Nineteenth Century Beginnings to the 1930s*, 2nd ed. (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press,

- 1993), 113; “Thomas, M. Carey,” *The National Cyclopaedia of American Biography* (New York: James T. White & Co., 1906), 13:84–85; Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 124.
- 82 *The occasion*: WW to ELA, November 28, 1884, *PWW*, 3:493.
- 82 *a reference*: Daniel Hoyt Gilman to Herbert B. Adams, August 19, 1884, in *Historical Scholarship in the United States, 1876–1901: As Revealed in the Correspondence of Herbert B. Adams*, ed. W. Stull Holt (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1938), 72 [464].
- 82 *tossing in bed*: Wilson confided to Ellen that his “anxiety” over whether he could bring himself to teach at a women’s college “has cost me both sleep and ease of mind,” with the result that “I am not feeling very well.” WW to ELA, November 30, 1884, *PWW*, 3:500.
- 82 “prefer to teach young men”: WW to ELA, December 6, 1884, *PWW*, 3:517 (Wilson’s emphasis).
- 82 *told him so*: When Ellen learned that even though Bryn Mawr’s dean was a woman it had “a man for President,” she was much relieved, writing Woodrow, “that makes it less *disagreeable*.” But, she added, “it’s being a school for women *must* remain an objection.” ELA to WW, December 1, 1884, *PWW*, 504.
- 82 “*The idea*”: WW to ELA, December 8, 1884, *PWW*, 3:526.
- 82 “*peculiarly susceptible*”: WW to EAW, February 14, 1889, *PWW*, 6:92.
- 82 *comely appearance*: For physical descriptions of Carey Thomas, see Helen Lefkowitz Horowitz, *The Power and Passion of M. Carey Thomas* (Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 1999), 133, and Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 173–74. These authors describe her “comely appearance,” “good looks,” “brilliant” and “energetic brown eyes,” and “lovely voice.”
- 82 “*altogether attractive*”: WW to ELA, November 27, 1884, *PWW*, 3:491.
- 83 “*which I propose*”: WW to ELA, November 30, 1884, *PWW*, 3:500.
- 83 *an unmistakable air*: WW to ELA, December 6, 1884, *PWW*, 3:517.
- 83 *taken aback . . . trial basis*: *Ibid.*; Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 155, 175.
- 83 *mistaken in thinking*: *Ibid.*, 175.
- 83 “*interesting experience*”: WW to ELA, December 6, 1884, *PWW*, 3:517.
- 84 *far more accomplished . . . rigorous standards*: Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 57–157; Horowitz, *Power and Passion*, 56–230; Marjorie Housepian Dobkin, ed., *The Making of a Feminist: Early Journals and Letters of M. Carey Thomas* (Kent, OH: Kent State University Press, 1979), 28; Bragdon, *Academic Years*, 144.
- 84 *racial and religious prejudices*: Thomas strongly resisted admitting Black students or hiring Jewish faculty. Horowitz, *Power and Passion*, 422–23. In a 1916 speech to Bryn Mawr’s freshman class, she expressed her hope that the “intellectual supremacy of the white races is maintained . . . for centuries to come.” Susan Snyder, “Bryn Mawr Confronts Racist Views of Former Leader,” *TCA Regional News (Chicago)*, August 25, 2017.
- 84 “*Stuff and nonsenses!*”: M. Carey Thomas Diary, January 6, 1871, in Dobkin, *Making of a Feminist*, 48–49.
- 84 *atheism and free love*: Logan Pearsall Smith, *Unforgotten Years* (London: Constable and Co., 1938), 78.
- 84 “*Boston marriage*”: Professor Leila J. Rupp recounts the Thomas-Gwinn relationship in detail in *A Desired Past: A Short History of Same-Sex Love in America* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999). It was during their time together in Switzerland in the early 1880s, she writes, that Thomas “formed with her Baltimore friend Mamie Gwinn what they both considered a marriage.” *Ibid.*, 90. According to historian Lillian Faderman, “Thomas left many papers that revealed her lesbianism.” While earlier in her life she experienced heterosexual feelings, during the period 1877–78 she fell in love with two women simultaneously. With one of these women, Mamie Gwinn, she entered into “a mutually nonmonogamous partnership that lasted almost a quarter century.” Faderman, *To Believe In Women: What Lesbians Have Done for America—A History* (New York: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2000), 201, 385–86n201. See also Leslie Mukau, “Johns Hopkins and the Feminist Legacy: How a Group of Baltimore Women Shaped American Graduate Medical Education,” *American Journal of Clinical Medicine*, vol. 9, no. 3 (Fall 2012), 188–127 at 124.
- 84 *natural antipathy*: Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 175, 178.
- 84 *reluctant to hire him*: Minutes of the Executive Committee of the Board of Trustees of Bryn Mawr College, December 20, 1884, *PWW*, 3:568n1.
- 85 “*much less a Fellow*”: WW to ELA, April 27, 1885, *PWW*, 4:532.
- 85 “*could not pass*”: *Ibid.*

- 85 “as a criminal”: WW to ELA, January 10, 1885, *PWW*, 3:595.
- 85 *complained about the terms*: WW to ELA, January 13, 1885, *PWW*, 3:604.
- 85 *president’s job*: Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 170.
- 85 *ruling spirit*: Ibid., 171; Bragdon, *Academic Years*, 144.
- 85 *course curriculum*: James E. Rhoads to WW, January 10, 1885, *PWW*, 3:596.
- 85 *go over Thomas’s head*: Dobkin, *Making of a Feminist*, 20n7.
- 85 “How ridiculous!”: ELA to WW, November 28, 1884, *PWW*, 3:494.
- 85 “same gifts”: WW to ELA, March 1, 1885, *PWW*, 4:317 (Wilson’s emphases).
- 85 *consoled himself*: WW to ELA, January 13, 1885, *PWW*, 3:603.
- 85 *only faculty member ... she was responsible*: Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 172–74.
- 86 *graduate fellows*: M. Carey Thomas to WW, August 15, 1885, *PWW*, 5:13–15.
- 86 *he objected*: M. Carey Thomas to WW, c. May 17, 1887, *PWW*, 5:505; WW to Thomas, May 17, 1887, *PWW*, 5:506.
- 86 *wrote the publisher*: Editorial Note: Wilson’s Plan for a Textbook in Civil Government, *PWW*, 5:147. The publisher, D.C. Heath & Co., agreed to accept Wilson as sole author. The result was *The State*, published three years later.
- 86 *school business*: Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 173–74.
- 86 “keep house for me”: WW to ELA, January 19, 1885, *PWW*, 3:622.
- 86 *making their own beds*: Horowitz, *Power and Passion*, 197.
- 86 *clashed with Thomas*: Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 175.
- 86 *students gossiped*: Bragdon, *Academic Years*, 159–60.
- 86 “relaxing my mental muscle”: WW to Robert Bridges, November 30, 1887, *PWW*, 5:632.
- 87 “through a vacuum” ... “evolution of fashion”: WW confidential journal, October 20, 1887, *PWW*, 5:619.
- 87 “Mr. Wilson preferred”: Mary Tremain to Ray Stannard Baker, n.d., quoted in *LL*, 1:291.
- 87 “too docile”: Virginia Kays Creesy, “Woodrow Wilson Amid the ‘Demure Damsels,’” *Princeton Alumni Weekly*, vol. 75, no. 17 (March 4, 1975), 8.
- 87 *complained about the “strain”*: WW to ELA, October 4, 1887, *PWW*, 5:605.
- 87 “singularly ill-adapted”: Letters from Lucy Salmon to Ray Stannard Baker, January 15 and February 1, 1926, quoted in Bragdon, *Academic Years*, 436n21.
- 87 “must not anticipate”: C.K. Adams to Lucy Maynard Salmon, June 3, 1886, in Louise Fargo Brown, *Apostle of Democracy: The Life of Lucy Maynard Salmon* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1943), 100–01.
- 87 “an audience” ... *never whole-heartedly*: Lucy Salmon to Ray Stannard Baker, February 1, 1926, Baker Papers, Library of Congress, quoted in Brown, *Apostle of Democracy*, 101–02.
- 87 “deadly secret”: *LL*, 1:261.
- 87 “unconscious”: Lucy Salmon to Ray Stannard Baker, February 1, 1926, Baker Papers, Library of Congress, quoted in Brown, *Apostle of Democracy*, 101–02.
- 87 “interesting and inspiring”: Mary Tremain to Ray Stannard Baker, n.d., quoted in *LL*, 1:290.
- 88 *essays, and a college textbook*: Bragdon, *Academic Years*, 155.
- 88 *leaned on him*: Ibid., 159; Axson, *Brother Woodrow*, 58; Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 175; *LL*, 1:236.
- 88 “Sorry a figure” ... “I need a degree now”: WW to Herbert Baxter Adams, April 2, 1886 and April 8, 1886, *PWW*, 5:150–51, 155 (Wilson’s emphasis).
- 88 “no chance” ... “very easily”: Herbert Baxter Adams to WW, April 7, 1886, *PWW*, 5:154 (Adams’s emphasis).
- 88 *gave him credit*: Herbert Baxter Adams to WW, April 7, 1886, *PWW*, 5:154; Axson, *Brother Woodrow*, 58; Victoria Bissell Brown, “Conservative Among Progressives,” in Axtell, *Educational Legacy*, 139; W. Barksdale Maynard, *Woodrow Wilson: Princeton to the Presidency* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008), 30.
- 88 “exceedingly fair”: WW to ELA, May 29, 1886, *PWW*, 5:267.
- 88 *Thomas had endured*: Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 122–23; Brown, “Conservative Among Progressives,” 138–39.
- 89 *put her on a train*: WW to EAW, April 16, 1886, *PWW*, 5:156 and n3; WW to EAW, April 16, 1886, *PWW*, 5:158. When she boarded the train, the baby was expected in “two or three weeks.” WW to Robert Bridges, April 19, 1886, *PWW*, 5:163.

- 89 *complications*: Ludwig M. Deppisch, M.D, *The Health of the First Ladies* (Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Co., 2015), 107–08.
- 89 *septicemia*: Miller, *Ellen and Edith*, 7.
- 89 *arrived in Georgia*: Louisa Brown to WW, April 16, 1886, *PWW*, 5:158.
- 89 “*unquestionably hastened*”: WW to Robert Bridges, April 19, 1886, *PWW*, 5:163.
- 89 *not “for the pain”*: Louisa Brown to WW, April 16, 1886, *PWW*, 5:158.
- 89 “*enjoy” himself*: Louisa Brown to WW, April 17, 1886, *PWW*, 5:160.
- 89 “*seeing all sorts of things*”: WW to EAW, April 15, 16, 1886, *PWW*, 5:156, 157.
- 89 “*My heart aches*”: EAW to WW, April 21, 1886, *PWW*, 5:166.
- 89 “*seeing the homes*”: WW to EAW, April 23, 24, 25, 1886, *PWW*, 5:167, 169, 171.
- 90 *what he really wanted*: Axson, *Brother Woodrow*, 35.
- 90 *ruled him out*: James Burrill Angell to WW, November 12, 1887, *PWW*, 5:628; Edward Ireland Renick to WW, November 1 and 4, 1887, *PWW*, 5:621–22.
- 90 *going abroad ... another academic year*: WW to Robert Bridges, January 23, 1887, *PWW*, 5:433; WW to Philip Gilbert Hamerton, January 4, 1887, *PWW*, 5:428n2.
- 90 *seemed to focus*: Bragdon, *Academic Years*, 152.
- 90 *seemed “more interested”*: Lucy Maynard Salmon to Ray Stannard Baker, n.d., quoted in *LL*, 1:153.
- 90 *first-ever floor vote*: 18 Cong. Rec. pt. 1, 49th Cong., 2nd Sess. (January 25, 1887) (roll call on S.R. 5, the future Anthony Amendment), 1002.
- 90 *marveled at the votes*: “Woman Suffrage in the Senate,” *New York Times*, January 26, 1887, 4.
- 91 *excerpts from the debate*: “Woman’s Suffrage—Constitutional Amendment Defeated in the Senate—Ungallant Senators Two to One,” *Philadelphia Inquirer*, January 26, 1887, 7.
- 91 “*great deeds by women*”: 18 Cong. Rec. pt. 1, 49th Cong., 2nd Sess. (January 25, 1887), 984 (remarks of Sen. Dolph on S.R. 5).
- 91 *predictable objection*: *Ibid.*, 986, 988 (remarks of Sen. Vest on S.R. 5).
- 91 *undisclosed*: Finch, *Carey Thomas*, 176.
- 91 “*graduated in law*” ... “*waxed eloquent*”: *Southern Horizons: The Autobiography of Thomas Dixon, A Critical Edition*, ed. M. Karen Crowe (PhD diss., New York University, 1982), 273–75.
- 91 “*crisis in my career*”: WW to Thomas Dixon, quoted in *ibid.*, 407; Raymond A. Cook, *Fire from the Flint* (Winston-Salem, NC: John F. Blair Publishers, 1968), 170.
- 91 *no effort*: Thomas Dixon to WW, June 7, 1887, *PWW*, 5:515; Thomas Henderson Pritchard to Joseph Ruggles Wilson, June 8, 1887, *PWW*, 5:516; Joseph Ruggles Wilson to WW, June 11, 1887, *PWW*, 5:516.
- 92 *June 9, 1887*: William Hartwell Pace to WW, June 20, 1887, *PWW*, 5:520
- 92 *press notices Dixon mailed*: EAW to WW, July 20, 1887, *PWW*, 5:533–34.
- 92 “*Wear it long*”: Joseph Ruggles Wilson to WW, June 11, 1887, *PWW*, 5:516.
- 92 *source of his claim*: Joseph Wilson’s actual terminal degree was an A.B. from Jefferson College (PA) in 1844. The honorary degree was from Oglethorpe University in central Georgia in 1857.
- 92 “*I am grieved*”: Joseph Ruggles Wilson to WW, September 22, 1887, *PWW*, 5:592.
- 92 *pathetic circumstances*: Joseph Ruggles Wilson to WW, March 5, 1888, *PWW*, 5:705.
- 92 *a telegram*: Joseph R. Wilson, Jr., to WW, telegram, April 15, 1888, *PWW*, 5:718.
- 92 “*only the servant*” ... “*almost broken*”: WW to EAW, April 18, 1888, *PWW*, 5:718.