

WOODROW WILSON

THE LIGHT WITHDRAWN

Extended Notes

5. Bittersweet at Princeton

PAGE

- 53 *Presbyterian teachings*: Henry W. Bragdon, *Woodrow Wilson: The Academic Years* (Cambridge: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1967), 18.
- 53 *wholly of southerners*: *LL*, 1:82.
- 53 “*Star Spangled Banner*”: Wilson told his fiancée Ellen Axson that the first time he heard the Star Spangled Banner was 1884, when he was 27 years old. WW to ELA, March 25, 1884, *PWW*, 3:98. It had been a popular patriotic song since the early 19th century, claimed by both North and South, but during Reconstruction it became an increasingly powerful symbol of Union. “How the National Anthem Has Unfurled,” *New York Times*, June 27, 2014, AR–10.
- 53 “*very full of the South*” ... “*getting quite bitter*”: Interview with Robert H. McCarter, July 15, 1940, in Bragdon, *Academic Years*, 21–22.
- 54 “*honor men*”: “1879 Senior Honors,” in *Academic Honors in Princeton University, 1748–1902* (Princeton: C.S. Robinson & Co., 1902), 103–06; *LL*, 1:85; John Milton Cooper, Jr., *Woodrow Wilson: A Biography* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2009), 27.
- 54 “*preparatory school*”: Bragdon, *Academic Years*, 16.
- 54 *debating club*: Hale, *Wilson*, 66–67.
- 54 “*Tar Heels*”: A. Scott Berg, *Wilson* (New York: G.P. Putnam’s Sons, 2013), 58.
- 54 *John C. Calhoun and Henry Clay*: WW Shorthand Diary, July 10, 1876, *PWW*, 1:151.
- 54 “*stout opinions*”: Hale, *Wilson*, 56.
- 54 *Hayes had supported*: Ari Hoogenboom, *Rutherford Hayes: Warrior and President* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 1995), 197–201, 208–10.
- 54 *supported Black suffrage*: *Ibid.*, 211–13; J.Q. Howard, *The Life, Public Services and Select Speeches of Rutherford B. Hayes* (Cincinnati: Robert Clarke & Co., 1876), 69, 72–74, 78–79, 123.
- 54 “*salvation of the country*”: WW Shorthand Diary, November 6, 1876, *PWW*, 1:221.
- 54 *former slaveholder*: Ernest Samuels, *Henry Adams: The Middle Years* (Cambridge: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1958), 27–28.
- 54 *a lengthy article*: William Henry Trescot, “The Southern Question,” *North American Review*, vol. 123, no. 253 (October 1876), 249–280, at 266, 271.
- 54 *defending Klansmen*: Allen W. Trelease, *White Terror: The Ku Klux Klan Conspiracy and Southern Reconstruction* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2023), 399–400.
- 55 “*outdoor recreation*”: Janet Woodrow Wilson to WW, September 25, 1876, *PWW*, 1:200.
- 55 “*make them intelligent*”: William Henry Trescot, “The Southern Question,” *North American Review*, vol. 123, no. 253 (October 1876), 249–280, at 273, 275–77.
- 55 “*excellent article*”: WW Shorthand Diary, November 2, 1876, *PWW*, 1:219.
- 55 “*weak instrument*”: *Ibid.*, October 13, 1876, *PWW*, 1:208.
- 55 “*one of my favorites*”: *Ibid.*, November 4, 1876, *PWW*, 1:220.
- 55 “*offensive sayings*”: Janet Woodrow Wilson to WW, November 8, 1876, *PWW*, 1:223.
- 55 “*insolence*” ... “*knocking anybody down*”: Janet Woodrow Wilson to WW, November 15, 1876, *PWW*, 1:228.
- 55 “*white with rage*” ... “*You don’t know*”: William Allen White, *Woodrow Wilson: The Man, His Times, and His Task* (New York: Hough-ton Mifflin Co., 1924), 73; *LL*, 1:82.

- 55 *a “Tilden Democrat”*: “The Political Predestination of Woodrow Wilson,” *North American Review*, vol. 196, no. 681 (August 1912), 145–153, at 152. The comparison was first made by a Wilson supporter writing in the *New York Times* during the 1910 New Jersey gubernatorial campaign. Charles Willis Thompson, “Wilson—A Tilden, But A Tilden Up to Date,” *New York Times*, September 25, 1910, 7.
- 55 *best known*: “Tilden and Tweed,” *New York Times*, July 11, 1876, 4; Roy Morris, Jr., *Fraud of the Century* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2003), 103–104.
- 55 *convention delegate*: Eric Foner, *Politics and Ideology in the Age of the Civil War* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1981), 80.
- 56 *human “property”*: Theodore P. Cook, *The Life and Public Services of Hon. Samuel J. Tilden, Democratic Nominee for President of the United States* (New York: D. Appleton and Co., 1876), 84; Adam I.P. Smith, *No Party Now: Politics in the Civil War North* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), 75.
- 56 *“scandal and shame”*: Cook, *Samuel J. Tilden*, 139.
- 56 *After the war*: S. J. Tilden to R.C. Root, February 28, 1868 (“Our position must be condemnation and reversal of negro supremacy [and of] admitting the blacks and organizing them through the Freeman’s [sic] Bureau”); S.J. Tilden, Augustus Schell, and August Belmont to W.F. Story, October 17, 1868 (rejecting “suffrage for negroes as a national right”); both in John Bigelow, ed., *Letters and Literary Memorials of Samuel J. Tilden*, vol. 1 (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1908).
- 56 *“A great deal depends”*: WW Shorthand Diary, November 7, 1876, *PWW*, 1:222.
- 56 *essay in his third year ... “earnest study”*: WW, “Some Thoughts on the Present State of Public Affairs,” c. January 30, 1878, *PWW*, 1:347.
- 56 *refused to take part*: Charles Andrew Talcott to WW, May 21, 1879, *PWW*, 1:484.
- 56 *“anarchy”*: Joseph Ruggles Wilson to WW, April 17, 1879, *PWW*, 1:477.
- 56 *“you could not enter”*: Janet Woodrow Wilson to WW, May 13, 1879, *PWW*, 1:479–80; Joseph Ruggles Wilson to WW, April 17, 1879, *PWW*, 1:477 and Editorial Note, “Wilson’s Refusal to Enter the Lynde Competition,” *PWW*, 1:480.
- 57 *“you were right”*: Charles Andrew Talcott to WW, May 21, 1879, *PWW*, 1:484.
- 57 *essay*: WW, “Cabinet Government in the United States,” *International Review*, vol. 6 (August 1879), 146–63, in *PWW*, 1:493–510; Ronald J. Pestritto, *Woodrow Wilson and the Roots of Modern American Liberalism* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2005), 134.
- 57 *“indisputably true”*: WW, “Cabinet Government.” *PWW*, 1:493.
- 57 *Woolsey*: President, Yale College, 1846–71; author of *Political Science*, 2 vols. (New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1877 [1889]); editor of Francis Lieber’s *Manual of Political Ethics, Designed Chiefly for the Use of Colleges and Students at Law*, 2 vols., 2nd rev. ed. (Philadelphia: J.B. Lippincott & Co., 1875).
- 57 *“despotic” and “dangerous”*: Far from operating under “despotic authority” as Wilson claimed in his essay, the House and Senate of the 1870s were, if anything, handicapped by procedures that allowed a minority of members to frustrate the leadership, not to mention the majority of members. In the House, devices such as the “disappearing quorum,” and insistence on taking up bills in the order introduced unless two-thirds of the House voted otherwise, were frequently used to gain leverage over the agenda. The Senate established a right of unlimited debate in 1856, but did not adopt a cloture rule until 1917, in the meantime giving individual senators enormous leverage over the conduct of business. *Jefferson’s Manual of Parliamentary Practice* (New York: Clark & Maynard, 1873); Catherine Fisk and Erwin Chemerinsky, “The Filibuster,” *Stanford Law Review*, vol. 49, no. 2 (January 1997), 181–254, at 195.
- 58 *first-hand research*: In a later essay on the workings of Congress, Wilson feigned first-hand knowledge of the institution by describing a visit to the House of Representatives, though he had never been there himself. While his description sounds as if it is a first-hand account, Wilson actually borrowed from news reports of congressional proceedings. Pestritto, *Wilson and the Roots of Modern American Liberalism*, 135. Even by the time he published his book on congressional procedures, he had not yet visited the Capitol. “Woodrow Wilson, 1885” (undated publication), U.S. Senate Historical Office (Wilson “prepared *Congressional Government* without visiting

- Congress or conducting research in congressional documents”). See text at 79 and corresponding endnote “*only fifty-two citations.*”
- 58 *overall weakness ... get in the way*: WW, *Constitutional Government in the United States* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1908), 54–56, 59–60, 86–87, 199–200, 204, 221.
- 58 *subsequently developed*: WW, *Congressional Government* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1885); WW, *Constitutional Government*.
- 58 *demurely back away*: Two years’ experience as governor of New Jersey may also have caused Wilson to abandon some of the naïve assertions about the legislative process he expressed during his academic years. As late as *Constitutional Government*, written near the end of his presidency of Princeton, he insisted that the executive branch of the federal government “is the only possible body of experts with regard to the practicability and necessity of alterations in the law.” (*Constitutional Government*, 85.) The *only* possible? The people’s elected representatives, informed by testimony from the private sector, the scientific community, and academia, are frequently more sensitive to the need for legislative change than is the bureaucracy or the leadership of the executive branch. Regardless of party or faction, members of Congress since the first days of the nation have understood that citizen input is vital to the lawmaking process. In the year preceding *Constitutional Government*, Congress issued more than 400 reports of legislative hearings. (ProQuest Congressional Database, 1907–08.) Wilson attended none of these hearings.
- 59 *public hearings*: HWS, 3:75–98 (reporting the resolution with unfavorable recommendation).
- 59 *suffrage amendment introduced*: 7 Cong. Rec. pt. 1, 45th Cong., 2nd Sess. (January 10, 1878), 252 (introduction of S. Res. 12 by Sen. Sargent).
- 59 “*our champion*”: HWS, 3:75; Laura DeForce Gordon to National Suffrage Convention, January 9, 1877, in HWS, 3:64.
- 59 *in the newspapers ... “hands of a few”*: “The Right of Women to Vote,” *New York Times*, January 12, 1878, 1; “The Woman Suffragists; Hearing by a Senate Committee,” *Washington Evening Star*, January 11, 1878, 1; “Woman Suffragists at the Capitol; Another Hearing by the Senate Committee,” *Washington Evening Star*, January 12, 1878, 1; “Woman’s Rights,” *Alexandria Gazette*, January 11, 1878, 3. Lawrence’s testimony was quoted in the *Times* article, while the *Gazette* noted that among “speeches being admitted by members of the committee to be the best that they ever heard from man or woman,” the “speech of Mrs. Lawrence was particularly eloquent.”
- 59 “*many sound arguments*”: “Woman Suffragists at the Capitol”; HWS, 3:97.
- 59 *Within four years*: 13 Cong. Rec. pt. 1, 47th Cong., 1st Sess. (January 9, 1882), 268 (Senate roll call creating Select Committee on Woman Suffrage); U.S. Senate, Report of the Select Committee on Woman Suffrage to accompany S. Res. 60, 47th Cong., 1st Sess., No. 686 (June 5, 1882) (reporting the Sargent amendment with favorable recommendation).
- 59 *House followed suit*: 13 Cong. Rec. pt. 2, 47th Cong., 1st Sess. (March 13, 1882), 1836 (appointment of members to House Select Committee on Woman Suffrage). In the 48th Congress, the select committee expired and its jurisdiction was transferred to the Committee on the Judiciary. 15 Cong. Rec. pt. 1, 48th Cong., 1st Sess. (December 20, 1883), 217–19; HWS, 5:386.
- 60 *final unraveling*: For the first time since the Civil War, the election of 1878 delivered a “Solid South” and a Democratic majority in the U.S. Senate. Woodward, *Reunion and Reaction*, 243; “Party Division,” 46th Congress, Senate.gov.
- 60 *minstrel character*: W.T. Lhamon, Jr., *Jump Jim Crow* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2003), vii–19.
- 60 *Susan B. Anthony*: In 1872, Anthony famously voted for the re-election of President Ulysses Grant and “the Republican ticket, straight,” for which she was arrested, tried, and convicted. Katharine Anthony, *Susan B. Anthony: Her Personal History and Her Era* (New York: Doubleday & Co., 1954), 277–83, 292–300. Throughout the fall, Anthony had campaigned for Grant, speaking along with Stanton, Olympia Brown, and other prominent suffragists at Republican rallies throughout New York. Together they extolled the Republican platform’s commitment to “the loyal women of America,” whose “honest demands” for “equal rights should be treated with respectful consideration”—the first time women’s rights were formally recognized by a major political party. It was, they said, “the nearest approach to an endorsement” of women’s suffrage to date. HWS, 4:1075; 2:520 and

- n150. Anthony attended the Republican convention and helped push through the plank. Melanie Susan Gustafson, *Women and the Republican Party, 1854–1924* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2001), 48.
- 60 *Sojourner Truth*: Truth unsuccessfully attempted to vote in Battle Creek, Michigan in 1872. *Battle Creek Journal*, November 13, 1872, Willard Library, Battle Creek, Michigan; Rosalyn Terborg-Penn, *African American Women in the Struggle for the Vote, 1850–1920* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1998), 40; Gustafson, *Women and the Republican Party*, 51.
- 60 *The justices agreed*: *Minor v. Happersett*, 88 U.S. 162 (1875).
- 60 *children*: *Ibid.*, 174–75.
- 60 *creative schemes*: Michael A. Smith, Kevin R. Anderson, and Chapman Rackaway, *State Voting Laws in America* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), 14–21.
- 61 “*more disastrous*”: *The Nation*, March 21, 1872, quoted in Blight, *Race and Reunion*, 123 and n50.
- 61 “*negro will disappear*”: *The Nation*, April 5, 1877, quoted in Blight, *Race and Reunion*, 138.
- 61 “*harder than I had feared*”: WW to Charles Andrew Talcott, July 7, 1879, *PWW*, 1:487.
- 61 “*very intimate*” ... “*political ambitions*”: *Ibid.*; WW to ELA, October 30, 1883, *PWW*, 2:499.
- 61 *meet again*: *LL*, 4:7.
- 61 “*held in common*”: WW to ELA, October 30, 1883, *PWW*, 2:499, 500.
- 61 *restriction of the suffrage*: 52 Cong. Rec. pt. 2, 63rd Cong., 3rd Sess. (January 12, 1915), 1483–84 (roll call on woman suffrage amendment, H.J. Res. 1, Rep. Talcott voting “nay”).
- 62 “*all my life*”: “President Refuses to Aid Suffragists,” *New York Times*, January 7, 1915, 12; “Suffragists to Call on Wilson Wednesday,” *Titusville (PA) Herald*, January 4, 1915, 3.
- 62 *summer of ‘79*: WW to Robert Bridges, July 30, September 4, 1879, *PWW*, 1:489, 539.
- 62 *calling cards*: *LL*, 1:104.
- 62 *began to sign*: See, for example, WW to Charles Andrew Talcott, December 31, 1879, *PWW*, 1:591.
- 62 *dignified-sounding*: White, *Wilson*, 89.
- 62 *tradition of Thomas Jefferson*: Frank Dewey, “Thomas Jefferson’s Law Practice,” *Virginia Magazine of History and Biography*, vol. 85, no. 3 (July 1977), 289–301.
- 62 *well-established path*: White, *Wilson*, 84.
- 62 “*disgusts me*”: WW to Charles Andrew Talcott, December 31, 1879, *PWW*, 1:591.
- 62 *campus offices ... political questions*: *LL*, 1:115, 118–23, 131.
- 62 *tainting “our English blood”*: WW to Charles Andrew Talcott, May 20, 1880, *PWW*, 1:655.
- 62 “*restriction of the suffrage*”: Minutes of the Jefferson Society, February 6, 1880 and February 28, 1880, *PWW*, 1:602, 608.
- 62 “*Absolute identity*”: “John Bright—A Biographical Essay,” March 6, 1880, *PWW*, 1:608–621, at 617.
- 63 *accompanying article*: WW, “John Bright,” *Virginia University Magazine*, vol. 19, no. 6 (March 1880), 354–70, in *PWW*, 1:608–621.
- 63 “*friend of the Union*” ... “*righteousness of the cause*”: *PWW*, 1:619.
- 63 “*stupendous act of guilt*” ... “*trampled in the dust*”: John Bright, “America,” speech in House of Commons, June 30, 1863, in James E. Thorold Rogers, ed., *Speeches by the Right Hon. John Bright, M.P.* (London: Macmillan & Co., 1878), 135–143, at 143; WW’s marginal notes to John Bright’s speech, *PWW*, 1:665.
- 63 “*real mob*”: John Bright, “Canada,” speech in House of Commons, March 13, 1865, in Rogers, *Speeches*, 64–76, at 73–74.
- 63 “*unjust censures*”: WW’s marginal notes, *PWW*, 1:664–65.
- 63 *morally wrong*: Four years later, in a letter to a friend celebrating the election of Grover Cleveland and the restoration of Democratic rule, Wilson elaborated on his distinction between the Civil War’s having been a mistake (an “easy and cheap” observation that anyone could make in hindsight, he said) and its having been “morally” wrong. Wilson condemned calling secession “morally wrong” and wrote of the Civil War that he “would fight it again if placed once more in the same circumstances.” WW to John Hansen Kennard, Jr., November 18, 1884, *PWW*, 3:455–56.
- 64 “*appeal irresistibly*”: WW to ELA, October 30, 1883, *PWW*, 1:499, 502.

- 64 *from the chairman*: Report of James F. Harrison, M.D., Chairman of the Faculty, University of Virginia, June 1, 1880, *PWW*, 1:659 and note.
- 64 *followed up ... avoid discipline*: Janet Woodrow Wilson to WW, June 5, 1880, *PWW*, 1:659; Joseph Ruggles Wilson to WW, June 7, 1880, *PWW*, 1:659; Janet Woodrow Wilson to WW, June 18, 1880, *PWW*, 1:661.
- 64 *“depressed”*: Marion Woodrow Bones to WW, June 14, 1880, *PWW*, 1:660.
- 64 *“vacation loaf” ... “most rests me”*: WW to Robert Bridges, August 22, 1880 and September 18, 1880, *PWW*, 1:671, 1:675.
- 65 *“law, law, law”*: WW to Charles Andrew Talcott, May 20, 1880, *PWW*, 1:655.
- 65 *upset stomach ... without comment*: Editorial Note: Wilson’s Withdrawal from the University of Virginia, *PWW*, 1:704.