

WOODROW WILSON

THE LIGHT WITHDRAWN

Extended Notes

27. Unshaken

PAGE

- 337 *Winslow joined*: “Pickets in Jail Hospital Go on a Hunger Strike,” *Washington Herald*, November 7, 1917, 3; “2 Suffragettes Go on Hunger Strike,” *Baltimore Sun*, November 7, 1917, 1. “Alice Paul Starts Jail Hunger Strike,” *Boston Globe*, November 7, 1917, 18.
- 337 *every borough*: Rusty C. Tobin, “Who Voted for Woman Suffrage,” *New York History*, vol. 98, no. 3/4 (Summer/Fall 2017), 422–40, at 435n5, 436.
- 337 *multi-partisan roster*: Brooke Kroeger, *The Suffragents: How Women Used Men to Get the Vote* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2017), 222–31.
- 337 *“the many men”*: James Lees Laidlaw, “Men’s Leagues—Why,” *St. John’s (New Brunswick) Globe*, May 17, 1912, quoted in Kroeger, *Suffragents*, 101.
- 337 *Earlier this year*: “Presidential Suffrage for Michigan Women—Full Suffrage in 1918,” *The Michigan Suffragist*, vol. 4, no. 3 (April 1917), 1; “Partial Suffrage Passes in Senate,” *Lincoln Daily News*, April 21, 1917, 1; “Suffrage Measures Signed,” *Fargo Forum and Daily Republican*, January 24, 1917, 1; “Presidential Suffrage for Rhode Island,” *Boston Globe*, April 18, 1917, 16. Ohio and Indiana also enacted presidential suffrage in 1917, but both laws were overturned the same year: Ohio’s in a voter referendum, and Indiana’s in court.
- 337 *did not endorse*: Wilson wrote a brief note of congratulations to North Dakota’s governor after the fact. WW to Lynn Joseph Frazier, January 23, 1917, *PWW*, 40:549; WW to Carrie Chapman Catt, January 25, 1917, *PWW*, 41:13. He also wrote briefly to the president of the Tennessee Senate offering his support for a state suffrage bill there, after the state assembly had already approved it. “Wilson for Suff Bill,” *New York Sun*, March 4, 1917, 8. The Senate defeated the measure anyway.
- 338 *two sentences*: WW to Deborah Knox Livingston, September 4, 1917, *PWW*, 44:144.
- 338 *no observable impact*: “A Message from President Wilson to Mrs. Deborah Knox Livingston,” *Brunswick (ME) Record*, September 7, 1917, 1; S.D. 117, Resolves 1917, c. 4, Proposing an Amendment to the Constitution Granting Suffrage to Women Upon Equal Terms with Men, Maine State Legislature, 78th session (1917). The results of the balloting were: Yes, 20,604; No, 38,838.
- 338 *43 percent*: Rusty C. Tobin, “Who Voted for Woman Suffrage,” *New York History*, vol. 98, no. 3/4 (Summer/Fall 2017), 422–40, at 423.
- 338 *early enough*: WW to Vira Boarman Whitehouse, August 14, 1917, *PWW*, 43:462.
- 338 *lobbied Colonel House ... Wilson responded*: *Ibid.*; Vira Boarman Whitehouse to WW, August 10, 1917, *PWW*, 43:462n2.
- 338 *two more sentences*: WW to Vira Boarman Whitehouse, August 27, 1917, *PWW*, 44:62.
- 338 *endorsement from Wilson*: WW to Carrie Chapman Catt, October 13, 1917, *PWW*, 44:372.
- 338 *only white voters*: Writing for a Black audience, Catt and Shaw did not mention Wilson. Carrie Chapman Catt, “Votes for All,” *The Crisis*, vol. 15, no. 1 (Special Suffrage Number, November 1917), 19–21; Anna Howard Shaw, “Votes for All,” *ibid.*, 19.
- 338 *“so good an example”*: *Ibid.*, 43.
- 339 *page-one headline*: “‘Now, the Nation,’ Is Suff’s Slogan,” *Baltimore Sun*, November 7, 1917, 1.
- 339 *victory celebration*: “Women Citizens Pledge Votes to Nation’s Welfare,” *New York Times*, November 8, 1917, 1.
- 339 *“inevitable”*: *Chicago Sunday Herald*, November 18, 1917, reproduced in *The Suffragist*, vol. 5, no. 98 (December 8, 1917), 14.
- 339 *“renew our appeal”*: “Women Citizens Pledge Votes to Nation’s Welfare,” *New York Times*.

- 339 *Malone took the stage*: “Talk of Dropping Capital Pickets,” *New York Times*, November 9, 1917, 13.
- 340 “obeying an order”: “Court Decides Dr. Zinkhan Exceeded Law,” *Washington Evening Star*, November 7, 1917, 1; “Verdict of \$2,500 Against Zinkhan,” *Washington Post*, November 8, 1917, 1.
- 340 “must pay penalty”: Josephus Daniels Diary, November 9, 1917, *PWW*, 44:556.
- 341 *press statement*: Helen Hamilton Gardener to JPT, November 30, 1917, reel 210, ##59820–21, images 400–01, Executive Office File, 1912–21, *WWP*.
- 341 “everything that he can”: “Wilson Unshaken in Suffrage View,” *New York Times*, November 10, 1917, 1.
- 341 “very harshly”: JPT to WW, October 26, 1917, reel 210, #59743, image 314, Executive Office File, 1912–21, *WWP*.
- 341 “condition of mind”: JPT to WW, October 26, 1917, reel 210, #59744, image 315, Executive Office File, 1912–21, *WWP*.
- 341 *whitewash*: Jill Diane Zahniser and Amelia R. Fry, *Alice Paul: Claiming Power* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), 287.
- 342 *six-page letter*: William Gwynn Gardiner to WW, November 9, 1917, *PWW*, 44:559.
- 342 “Don’t you think”: WW to JPT, c. November 10, 1917, *PWW*, 44:559.
- 342 *very next day*: JPT to Lillian D. Wald, November 12, 1917, *PWW*, 45:39. Evidence of the transmittal to both women is a handwritten notation on the original of Gardiner’s letter to WW, “Copy sent Mrs. Amos Pinchot & Miss L.D. Wald Nov 13/17.”
- 342 *recent appointee*: “President Names Gardiner to Take Place of Newman,” *Washington Times*, September 29, 1917, 2.
- 342 *seeking a job*: “J.E. Laskey Named District Attorney; Nomination by President Ends Contest for Place With W. Gwynn Gardiner,” *Washington Times*, August 21, 1914, 4; “William Gwynn Gardiner,” *Washington Post*, June 12, 1912, 55; “Gardiner, W. Gwynn,” *Who’s Who in the Nation’s Capital*, 1921–22 (Washington, DC: Consolidated Publishing Co., 1921), 144.
- 342 *Jim Crow*: The changes to the Anthony Amendment that Sen. Lee endorsed would have repealed the 15th Amendment’s ban on voting restrictions based on “race, color, or previous condition of servitude.” 51 Cong. Rec. pt. 5, 63rd Cong., 2nd Sess. (March 19, 1914), 5091, 5097 (remarks of Sen. Lee).
- 342 *Gardiner’s report*: William Gwynn Gardiner to WW, November 9, 1917, *PWW*, 44:559.
- 342 *St. Elizabeth’s*: Congress originally named the facility the Government Hospital for the Insane. 10 Stat. 682 (Act of March 3, 1855). By the 20th century it was frequently referred to as St. Elizabeth’s, after the name of the land on which the hospital was constructed. The year before Alice Paul’s ordeal, Congress officially redesignated it St. Elizabeth’s Hospital, 39 Stat. 309 (Act of July 1, 1916), but it continued to be referred to by its original name or a combination of the two for several years thereafter. See, for example, *Malone v. Overholzer*, 93 F. Supp. 647 (D.D.C. 1950).
- 343 *fifty years later*: Alice Paul, “Conversations with Alice Paul: Woman Suffrage and the Equal Rights Amendment,” by Amelia R. Fry, *Suffragists Oral History Project*, University of California, Berkeley (1973), 225.
- 343 “considerable time”: William Gwynn Gardiner to WW, November 9, 1917, *PWW*, 44:559.
- 343 *leading questions*: *JFF*, 220–223.
- 343 *sixty pounds*: “To Bring Suit for Treatment of Miss Paul,” *Buffalo Evening News*, November 16, 1917, 1.
- 343 “very frail”: William Gwynn Gardiner to WW, November 9, 1917, *PWW*, 44:559.
- 343 “Go ahead”: *JFF*, 220–23.
- 343 *Kussmaul*: Theodore H. Bast, *The Life and Time of Adolf Kussmaul* (New York: Paul B. Hoeber, Inc., 1926), 110–11; Ray Clarke, “The Pioneers of Endoscopy and the Sword Swallowers,” *ENT & Audiology News*, March 3, 2021.
- 344 *intense debate ... patients who objected*: Ian Miller, *A History of Force Feeding: Hunger Strikes, Prisons and Medical Ethics, 1909–1974* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), 38.
- 344 *fully in command*: “W. Gwynn Gardiner Sworn In,” *Washington Times*, October 9, 1917, 1.
- 344 “publicity scheme”: Louis Brownlow, *A Passion for Anonymity* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1958), 77–79.
- 344 “force if necessary”: William Gwynn Gardiner to WW, November 9, 1917, *PWW*, 44:559.

- 344 “grossly exaggerated”: WW to JPT, c. November 10, 1917, reel 210, #59807, #59807, image 384, Executive Office File, 1912–21, WWP.
- 345 *single sentence*: “Hunger Striker Is Forcibly Fed,” *New York Times*, November 9, 1917, 13.
- 345 *prisoner access*: Lucy Burns to Members of the Woman’s Party, November 9, 1917, box I:80, reel 52, NWP Records, Manuscript Division, Library of Congress.
- 345 “kill my sister”: “Hunger Striker Is Forcibly Fed,” *New York Times*.
- 345 “you are human”: SWP, 58–59.
- 345 “bad day”: SWP, 283–84.
- 346 *make a statement*: JFF, 192.
- 346 *new recruits*: Dorothy Day, *The Long Loneliness: The Autobiography of Dorothy Day* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1997), 72–73; JFF, 192–94.
- 346 *permanently denied*: John Sayer, “Art and Politics, Dissent and Repression: The Masses Magazine versus the Government, 1917–1918,” *American Journal of Legal History*, vol. 32, no. 1 (January 1988), 42–78, at 55. When Eastman appealed to his friend the president, Wilson personally rejected his arguments. Max Eastman to WW, September 8, 1917, PWW, 44:169; WW to Max Eastman, September 18, 1917, PWW, 44:210. Shortly afterward, Eastman, four other editors, and the business manager of *The Masses* were criminally charged under the Espionage Act. “7 on ‘Masses’ Staff Indicted for Sedition,” *New York Tribune*, November 20, 1917, 14.
- 346 *journalist’s knack*: Day, *The Long Loneliness*, 73; “Arrest 41 Pickets for Suffrage at the White House,” *New York Times*, November 11, 1917, 1; “Police Net 40 Pickets,” *Washington Post*, November 11, 1917, 2; JFF, 192–94.
- 346 *paid their bond*: “Arrest 41 Pickets for Suffrage at the White House,” *New York Times*.
- 346 “fast as they appeared”: “Suffragist Pickets Get Arrested Again,” *New York Times*, November 13, 1917, 4.
- 347 “crowds poured out”: “White House Pickets Held Without Bail,” *New York Times*, November 14, 1917, 6; Day, *The Long Loneliness*, 72–73.
- 347 *All of the women*: “White House Pickets Held Without Bail,” *New York Times*; Day, *The Long Loneliness*, 73.
- 347 “got to live”: “A Note from Alice Paul,” *The Suffragist*, vol. 5, no. 96 (November 24, 1917), 6; JFF, 224.
- 347 *publicly preached*: “Soothing Effect of News,” *Popular Mechanics* (January 1912), advertising section, 138.
- 347 *another rebuff*: Dora Lewis to Mrs. O. H. P. Belmont, November 13, 1917, box I:80, reel 52, NWP Records, Manuscript Division, Library of Congress.
- 347 *listened patiently*: “The Government Holds ‘The Ringleader,’” *The Suffragist*, vol. 5, no. 96 (November 24, 1917), 5; “Banners Torn From Women,” *Los Angeles Times*, November 14, 1917, 4.
- 348 “make himself famous”: Helen Paul to Tacie Paul, November 13, 1917, Papers of Alice Paul, Schlesinger Library, Radcliffe Institute, Harvard University.
- 348 *bedside*: Gertrude Hunter, “The Legal Aspect of the Suffrage Case,” *The Suffragist*, vol. 5, no. 85 (September 8, 1917), 7; Matthew E. O’Brien to Alice Paul, August 27, 1917, box I:74, reel 47, NWP Records, Manuscript Division, Library of Congress.
- 348 *across the country*: “White House Pickets Held Without Bail,” *New York Times*, November 14, 1917, 6; “Malone Sees Hunger Strikers After Habeas Corpus Action,” *Boston Globe*, November 14, 1917, 10; “Throngs Angered by Women Pickets,” *San Francisco Chronicle*, November 14, 1917, 2; “Suffragist Pickets Riot; 31 Arrested,” *San Francisco Examiner*, November 14, 1917, 3; “Banners Torn From Women,” *Los Angeles Times*, November 14, 1917, 4.
- 348 *prison uniforms*: “Prison Styles for Washington Suffragists,” *Chicago Tribune*, November 19, 1917, 5; “How the Suffragettes Look After Their Jail Terms,” *Los Angeles Times*, November 14, 1917, 4.
- 348 *Malone told reporters*: “The Government Holds ‘The Ringleader,’” *The Suffragist*, vol. 5, no. 96 (November 24, 1917), 5; “White House Pickets Held Without Bail,” *New York Times*, November 14, 1917, 6.
- 349 “Six months”: “31 Militants Sent Back to Occoquan,” *Washington Post*, November 15, 1917, 11; “31 More Pickets Sent to Workhouse,” *New York Times*, November 15, 1917, 6.
- 349 *at the District Jail*: JFF, 235. Because the prisoners were immediately transferred to Occoquan, the newspapers inaccurately reported they were “sentenced” there. The fact they were actually sentenced to jail would be the basis for a subsequent court determination that they were illegally imprisoned.