

WOODROW WILSON

THE LIGHT WITHDRAWN

Extended Notes

18. 'He Kept Us Out of Suffrage'

PAGE

- 230 *forged shells*: The Hotchkiss Company in Sharon, Connecticut, four miles from Amenia, made rifle munitions for the Union Army. Federal Writer's Project, *Connecticut: A Guide to Its Roads, Lore, and People* (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1938), 418.
- 230 *national importance*: David L. Lewis, *W. E. B. Du Bois: A Biography* (New York: Henry Holt and Co., 2009), 340.
- 230 *committed suffragists*: "The Amenia Conference, August 24–25–26, 1916," pamphlet, NAACP Papers, Part 11, NAACP Records, Manuscript Division, Library of Congress; "Amenia," *The Crisis*, vol. 12, no. 6 (October 1916), 276–77; "Amenia Conference Album," enclosure to letter from Roy Nash to W. E. B. Du Bois, August 7, 1916, Series 1A, General Correspondence (listing Amenia Conference acceptances), W. E. B. Du Bois Papers, Special Collections and University Archives, Amherst Libraries, University of Massachusetts; NAACP photograph of conference held at estate of Joel Spingarn, Amenia, NY, August 1916 (depicting Addie W. Hunton, William Pickens, Arthur Spingarn, Mary Talbert, and Mary Church Terrell), NAACP Records, Manuscript Division, Library of Congress; Lewis, *Du Bois*, 340; Joyce A. Hanson, *Mary McLeod Bethune and Black Women's Political Activism* (Columbia, MO: University of Missouri Press, 2003), 47–54.
- 230 *summer estate*: Marshall Van Deusen, *J.E. Spingarn* (New York: Twayne Publishers, Inc., 1971), 60–61; Lewis, *Du Bois*, 340.
- 230 *run for Congress*: Van Deusen, *Spingarn*, 23–24.
- 230 *Four years earlier*: "Spingarn to Fight Butler," *New York Times*, March 8, 1912, 10; Mark Sullivan, "Armageddon at Chicago," *Collier's Weekly*, vol. 49, no. 23 (August 24, 1912), 13.
- 231 *quit the Socialist Party*: W. E. B. Du Bois, *Dusk of Dawn*, ed. Louis Gates, Jr. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), 118.
- 231 *"since the Civil War"*: W. E. B. Du Bois, "I Won't Vote," *The Nation*, vol. 183, no. 16 (October 20, 1956), 324.
- 231 *several arguments*: Sheldon Avery, *Up from Washington: William Pickens and the Negro Struggle for Equality, 1900–1954* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 1989), 38–42.
- 231 *"inviolable privacy"*: "Amenia," *The Crisis*, vol. 12, no. 6 (October 1916), 267–277, at 277.
- 231 *"relic of barbarism"*: Mary Church Terrell, "Woman Suffrage and the 15th Amendment," in "Votes for Women: A Symposium by Leading Thinkers of Colored America," *The Crisis*, vol. 10, no. 4 (August 1915), 191.
- 231 *newly elected ... stressed*: "Mrs. Mary B. Talbert Women's President," *Colorado Statesman*, August 26, 1916, 1; Lillian Serece Williams, "National Association of Colored Women's Clubs, Inc.," in Nina Mjagkij, ed., *Organizing Black America: An Encyclopedia of African American Associations* (New York: Garland Publishing, Inc., 2001), 339–43, at 341.
- 231 *adopted resolutions*: "Colored Women O.K. Hughes for President," *Washington Evening Star*, August 13, 1916, 8.
- 231 *"tower of strength"*: N. H. Burroughs, "Black Women and Reform," in "Votes for Women: A Symposium by Leading Thinkers of Colored America," *The Crisis*, vol. 10, no. 4 (August 1915), 187.
- 231 *Hunton pointed out*: A.W. Hunton, "Y.W.C.A.," *ibid.*, 188–89, at 189.
- 231 *"votes for (white) women"*: Mary Church Terrell, "Woman Suffrage and the 15th Amendment," *ibid.*, 191.
- 231 *"produced results"*: Eben Miller, *Born Along the Color Line* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), 24.
- 232 *"wholesale murder"*: Du Bois, *Dusk of Dawn*, 118.
- 232 *"only alternative"*: Harriot Stanton Blatch and Alma Lutz, *Challenging Years: The Memoirs of Harriot Stanton Blatch* (New York: Putnam, 1940), *Challenging Years*, 269.

- 232 *grandfather clauses*: In *Guinn v. United States*, 238 U.S. 347 (1915) and *Myers v. Anderson*, 238 U.S. 368 (1915), Hughes voted to strike down the grandfather clauses in Oklahoma and Maryland. The decisions set a precedent for judicial intervention in cases involving race-based voting rights discrimination.
- 232 *striking down segregation*: *McCabe v. Atchison, Topeka & Santa Fe Railway Co.*, 235 U.S. 151 (1914).
- 232 *“black race’s redemption”*: George W. Harris, “Colored Citizens and the Present Campaign,” *Champion Magazine*, vol. 1, no. 1 (September 1916), 19–20. Harris was editor of the *New York News* from 1913–1936. In 1920, he was elected as New York City’s first Black alderman, serving until 1924. Everett L. Beanne, “Biographical Sketch of George W. Harris,” 1939, Arthur Alfonso Schomburg Papers, Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, New York Public Library; *Negro Year Book 1921–22*, ed. Monroe N. Work (Tuskegee Institute, 1922), 423.
- 232 *“due to him”*: “Justice Hughes,” *Champion Magazine*, vol. 1, no. 1 (September 1916), 5.
- 232 *educated readers*: Rosalyn Terborg-Penn, *African American Women in the Struggle for the Vote, 1850–1920* (Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press, 1998), 140–41.
- 232 *largest audience ... “brass bands”*: “Hughes Is Given Hearty Welcome to Denver,” *Omaha Daily Bee*, August 27, 1916, 1; “Hughes Sums Up Campaign Attacks,” *New York Times*, August 27, 1916, 5.
- 232 *“en masse”*: “Hon. Charles Evans Hughes, Republican Presidential Nominee, Denver’s Distinguished Visitor Today,” *Colorado Statesman*, August 26, 1916, 1.
- 232 *progressive reforms*: Robert F. Wesser, *Charles Evans Hughes: Politics and Reform in New York, 1905–1910* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1967), 304–21.
- 232 *Lenin Prize*: Du Bois, *Dusk of Dawn*, 177.
- 232 *voting for Hughes*: Du Bois, “I Won’t Vote” (“In 1916 I took Hughes as the lesser of two evils”); Charles Flint Kellogg, *NAACP: A History of the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, 1909–1920* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1973), 179; Christine A. Lunardini, “Standing Firm: William Monroe Trotter’s Meetings with Woodrow Wilson, 1913–1914,” *Journal of Negro History*, vol. 64, no. 3 (Summer 1979), 244–64, at 263n6. As of late October, when the November edition of *The Crisis* went to press, Du Bois was torn between Hughes and Allen Benson, the Socialist candidate, although he had been assured by NAACP treasurer John Millholland, father of Inez, that “Hughes’ attitude is right on every question.” In 1912 he had taken a risk on Wilson despite red flags because he “could not let Negroes throw away votes”; for the same reason, in 1916 he chose Hughes over Benson. Du Bois, *Dusk of Dawn*, 118; “Mr. Hughes,” *The Crisis*, vol. 13, no. 7 (November 1916), 12; Du Bois to JPT, October 24, 1916, *PWW*, 38:522; Du Bois, “I Won’t Vote.”
- 232 *western campaign swing*: “Hughes Plans for Coast Trip,” *New York Tribune*, July 14, 1916, 9.
- 233 *warning signs*: “Worry Over Hughes Trip; Chairman Willcox Faces Storm to Confer with Candidate,” *New York Times*, July 24, 1916, 5.
- 233 *would be best*: Frederick M. Davenport, “The Case of Hiram Johnson: Not Guilty,” *North American Review*, vol. 205, no. 735 (February 1917), 203–220, at 205–06.
- 233 *vetoed any delay*: *Ibid.*, 206.
- 233 *Amendment supporter ... too late*: William R. Willcox to Margaret J. Roberts, August 15, 1916, Margaret Stephenson Roberts Papers, Schlesinger Library, Radcliffe Institute, Harvard University; Davenport, “The Case of Hiram Johnson,” 206; Spencer C. Olin, Jr., “Hiram Johnson, the California Progressives, and the Hughes Campaign of 1916,” *Pacific Historical Review*, vol. 31, no. 4 (November 1962), 403–12, at 405.
- 233 *pilgrimage ... public endorsement*: Merlo J. Pusey, *Charles Evans Hughes* (New York: Macmillan, 1951), 1:340 and n5; “Johnson Out for Hughes,” *New York Times*, June 28, 1916, 8.
- 233 *“We are not divided”*: “An Invitation from Hughes,” *Los Angeles Times*, July 9, 1916, 5; Pusey, *Hughes*, 1:340.
- 234 *two-to-one*: Olin, “Hiram Johnson,” 410.
- 234 *at every stop*: Pusey, *Hughes*, 1:341.
- 234 *not what happened*: “California Moose Complain to Hughes,” *New York Times*, August 18, 1916, 4.
- 234 *excluded Johnson*: Pusey, *Hughes*, 1:343–44; Davenport, “Hiram Johnson,” 214–15; Olin, “Hiram Johnson,” 406.
- 234 *on his arrival*: “Political Clash Unchanged by Hughes–Rowell Parley,” *San Francisco Examiner*, August 18, 1916, 3; “Finds California Torn by Factions,” *New York Times*, August 19, 1916, 4.

- 234 *passing in the night*: Pusey, *Hughes*, 1:340–49.
- 234 *full public view*: “Crocker Is Determined to Misunderstand, Says Rowell,” *San Francisco Examiner*, August 27, 1916, 6; “Bacon’s Plea for Harmony Is Spurned,” *ibid.*; “Hughes Widens California Split,” *New York Times*, August 20, 1916, 1; “Say California Row Won’t Hurt Hughes,” *New York Times*, August 21, 1916, 1; “Hitchcock to Aid Willcox,” *New York Times*, August 23, 1916, 6; “Hughes Turns East; Strife Unallayed,” *New York Times*, August 23, 1916, 7.
- 234 *“Hughes’ attitude”*: “National Campaign from the Viewpoints of the Chairmen,” *San Francisco Examiner*, August 27, 1916, 6.
- 234 *Johnson won*: “Majority for Johnson About Twenty Thousand,” *Los Angeles Times*, September 1, 1916, 1.
- 234 *“We still hope”*: Davenport, “Hiram Johnson,” 203 (quoting Chester H. Rowell, Progressive national committeeman, Republican national committeeman, and member of Hughes national campaign committee).
- 235 *“promptly”*: Charles Evans Hughes, Speech of Acceptance at Carnegie Hall, New York, July 31, 1916, Republican Campaign Text-book (Washington: Republican National Committee, 1916), 2–19 at 17.
- 235 *reporters’ tables*: *HWS*, 5:496.
- 235 *theater’s entrance*: “Boardwalk at Delaware Ave. showing New Nixon Theatre,” Robert M. Skaler Postcard Collection, Athenaeum of Philadelphia, Athenaeum of Philadelphia Featured Collections.
- 235 *standing ovation ... sashed women*: *HWS*, 5:496.
- 235 *his remarks*: WW, Address to NAWSA Convention, Atlantic City, September 8, 1916, *PWW*, 38:161.
- 235 *13 percent*: In 1860, the total U.S. population was 31.44 million, of whom 3.95 million were enslaved people. *Population of the United States in 1860; Compiled from the Original Returns of the Eighth Census* (Washington: U.S. Census Bureau, Public Information Office, 2018).
- 236 *At the conclusion*: *HWS*, 5:496–99.
- 236 *“shall not quarrel”*: WW, Address to NAWSA Convention, *PWW*, 38:161; *HWS*, 5:496–99.
- 236 *“verbal fog”*: “The New Situation in Suffrage,” *New Republic*, vol. 9, no. 108 (November 25, 1916), 85–86.
- 237 *her own address*: Carrie Chapman Catt, “The Crisis,” address to NAWSA convention, Atlantic City, NJ, September 7, 1916, as published in *The Woman’s Journal*, vol. 47, no. 38 (September 16, 1916), 299.
- 237 *only in private ... primary elections*: *FDL*, images 18–20, MS 6–8.
- 237 *eleven states*: The states were: Arizona, California, Colorado, Idaho, Kansas, Montana, Nevada, Oregon, Utah, Washington, and Wyoming. In the twelfth state, Illinois, women could vote only in the presidential race.
- 237 *“white primary”*: Stephanie Haught Wade, “John Andrew Riggs and Arkansas’s Primary Suffrage Bill,” *Arkansas Historical Quarterly*, vol. 79, no. 3 (Autumn 2020), 254–277, at 263.
- 237 *“primary suffrage”*: Judith N. McArthur and Harold L. Smith, *Minnie Fisher Cunningham: A Suffragist’s Life in Politics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2003), 52–53. Southern suffragists who were committed to the Anthony Amendment felt betrayed. Sue Smith, a NAWSA officer since 1912, quit the organization and joined the National Woman’s Party as a result of Catt’s decision “that the southern states could not expect any help from the National.” Marjorie Spruill Wheeler, *New Women of the New South* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 170–71.
- 237 *perfectly attuned*: Earlier that year, when Catt worked with Wilson to insert a states’ rights suffrage plank in the 1916 Democratic platform, the Democratic leader of the Texas Woman Suffrage Association protested bitterly. Such deference, she said, made NAWSA complicit in Wilson’s “hypocritical” strategy designed solely “to avoid giving women the vote” in the South. It was unnecessary, she told Catt, since the Democratic candidate was guaranteed to carry the one-party South either way. McArthur and Smith, *Minnie Fisher Cunningham*, 52.
- 238 *question the chair*: Mary Gray Peck, *Carrie Chapman Catt* (New York: H. W. Wilson Co., 1944), 257. She would continue to show the same willingness to compromise on race two years later.
- 238 *Wilson’s next stop*: “President Returns and Prepares to Close White House,” *Washington Times*, September 5, 1916, 4.
- 238 *most of the bills*: Wilson lived at the lavish estate courtesy of the undisclosed donors, who paid all costs “except the upkeep of his own household,” an amount that he had “been accustomed to pay for a summer place.” “President Wilson Accepts Shadow Lawn for a ‘Summer Capitol,’ But Will Pay Rent,” *New York Sun*, October 16, 1915, 20. The grand hall alone was 6,000 square feet, surrounded by two tiers of wide galleries beneath a

- 100-foot high ceiling. The third of five floors was dedicated to an art gallery. “Wilson to Direct 1916 Campaign from Jersey Palace,” *Hedges (MT) Herald*, February 1, 1916, 2; “Summer Capitol Beautiful Home; Jersey to Give Wilsons Welcome,” *Long Branch (NJ) Daily Record*, October 22, 1915, 12.
- 238 “Kept Us Out of War”: National Platform of the Democratic Party, 1916, art. 27, in J. Bruce Kremer, comp., *Official Report of the Proceedings of the Democratic National Convention* (1916), 121–130, at 130.
- 238 “mothers of the land”: Address by Martin H. Glynn, June 14, 1916, *ibid.*, 14–41, at 26.
- 238 former schoolmate ... western United States: Jo Freeman, *A Room at a Time: How Women Entered Party Politics* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2000), 78.
- 238 “white woman’s burden”: “Woman Whom Senator Walsh Places in Charge of Big Campaign Work,” (Helena) *Independent-Record*, September 3, 1916, 8; “Mrs. George Bass,” *Little Falls Herald*, August 25, 1916, 5; “Mrs. George Bass at the Helm,” *Rock Island Argus*, August 29, 1916, 3; Freeman, *A Room at a Time*, 79.
- 239 peace message: Steven A. Seidman, *Posters, Propaganda, and Persuasion in Election Campaigns Around the World and Through History* (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, 2008), 53–54.
- 239 “to the end”: WW to Jane Jefferson Club, Denver, CO, August 7, 1916, reprinted in full at “President Pledges His Aid To Suffrage,” *New York Times*, August 13, 1916, 1. Wilson understood full well such statements were misleading. “I can’t keep the country out of war,” Josephus Daniels recalled Wilson confiding to him before the election. “Any little German lieutenant can put us into war at any time.” Daniels to Ray Stannard Baker, March 20, 1929, *LL*, 258.
- 239 “holding off”: WW, Address at the Chicago Auditorium, January 31, 1916, *PWW*, 36:63.
- 239 “greater aggressiveness”: Alice Hamilton, “As One Woman Sees the Issues,” *New Republic*, vol. 8, no. 101 (October 7, 1916), 239–41.
- 239 Wilson appealed directly: Harriet Hyman Alonso, *Peace as a Women’s Issue: A History of the U.S. Movement for World Peace and Women’s Rights* (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1993), 73.
- 239 “unneutral”: J. Lee Thompson, *Never Call Retreat: Theodore Roosevelt and the Great War* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 147.
- 239 “loyalty to [a] foreign power”: WW, Address at Long Branch, New Jersey Accepting the Democratic Nomination for President, September 2, 1916, *PWW*, 38:126.
- 239 “only one choice”: WW, Campaign Speech to Young Democrats at Shadow Lawn, *PWW*, September 30, 1916, 38:301; Arthur S. Link, *Wilson: Campaigns for Progressivism and Peace, 1916–1917* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1965), 105–06.
- 239 “If You Want War”: Thompson, *Never Call Retreat*, 152.
- 239 “go to hell”: Joslyn Barnhart and Robert F. Trager, “How Women Shape the Course of War: Women’s Suffrage and the Election of 1916,” *Security Studies*, vol. 31, no. 4 (August 2022), 703–735, at 716n57.
- 239 “our own citizens” ... Villa’s raids: WW, Address at Long Branch, New Jersey Accepting the Democratic Nomination for President, September 2, 1916, *PWW*, 38:126.
- 240 “too proud to fight”: WW, Address to Naturalized Citizens at Convention Hall, Philadelphia, May 10, 1915, *PWW*, 33:147. Even so, Secretary of State Bryan deemed Wilson’s private diplomatic correspondence with Germany too bellicose. Wilson’s increasing abandonment of strict neutrality in favor of the Allies ultimately led to Bryan’s resignation in June 1915. William Jennings Bryan and Mary Baird Bryan, *The Memoirs of William Jennings Bryan*, vol. 10 (Philadelphia: The John C. Winston Co., 1925), 395–428.
- 240 “inevitable” ... “cannot tell them”: JPT, *Woodrow Wilson As I Know Him* (Garden City, NY: Doubleday, Page & Co., 1921), 159.
- 240 “ought to be in now”: Harold Garnet Black, *The True Woodrow Wilson* (New York: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1946), 160–61. Arthur Link believed Secretary of War Garrison “understood Wilson’s faults better than almost any other member of his circle.” Arthur S. Link, *Wilson: The New Freedom* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1956), 121. Garrison judged harshly Wilson’s willingness to decide issues of war and peace on the basis of politics. “He was a man of high ideals but no principles,” Garrison wrote privately of Wilson after his death. Lindley M. Garrison to William E. Brooks, February 24, 1929, Papers of William E. Brooks, Manuscript Division, Library of Congress.

- 240 *“sordid, soft, and spineless”*: Theodore Roosevelt, “The Soul of the Nation,” Address at Cooper Union, November 3, 1916, in Herman Hagedorn, ed., *The Works of Theodore Roosevelt*, vol. 20 (New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1925), 515–27, at 527; Thompson, *Never Call Retreat*, 151.
- 240 *her own slogan*: “Call to the Women Voters: ‘Vote Against Wilson—He Kept Us Out of Suffrage,’” *The Suffragist*, vol. 4, no. 46 (November 11, 1916), 7–9.