

# WOODROW WILSON

## THE LIGHT WITHDRAWN

### Extended Notes

#### 12. 'Walking on Air'

PAGE

- 155 “*speeding automobiles*”: Sergei Eisenstein, “Dickens, Griffith, and the Film Today,” in Jay Leyda, ed., *Film Form: Essays in Film Theory* (New York: Harcourt, Inc., 1977), 198.
- 156 *publicly proclaiming*: “Nellie Bly and Thomas C. Platt,” *New York World*, December 9, 1894, 1; “Nellie Bly and Young Astor,” *New York World*, May 13, 1894, 1.
- 156 “*presidents of colleges*”: U.S. Supreme Court Justice David J. Brewer, “Woman Suffrage: Its Present Position and Its Future,” *The Ladies’ World*, December 1909, excerpted in 52 Cong. Rec. pt. 6, 63rd Cong., 3rd Sess., Appendix (January 12, 1915), 102 (extension of remarks of Rep. Mondell).
- 156 *for thirty years*: “Journal,” April 29, 1882, folder 812, Champ and Bennett Champ Clark Papers (C0666), State Historical Society of Missouri Research Center—Columbia. In this early journal entry, Clark references “an article I had written in favor of Woman Suffrage.”
- 156 *flushed him out*: Harmon would vote “no” on Ohio’s state suffrage amendment in September 1912. “Harmon Discusses Amendments; Will Vote ‘No’ on Many Sections,” *Cincinnati Enquirer*, September 3, 1912, 14.
- 156 *unconditionally opposed*: Elisabeth Joan Doyle, “The Congressional Career of Oscar W. Underwood of Alabama” (master’s thesis, Indiana University, 1948), 150; Marjorie Spruill Wheeler, *New Women of the New South* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 147–48, 150.
- 157 *Phoebe Hearst*: Alexandra M. Nickliss, *Phoebe Apperson Hearst: A Life of Power and Politics* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2018), 387. Hearst *mère* had also made the single largest cash donation to California’s unsuccessful 1896 suffrage ballot measure. *Ibid.*, 373. She would later join forces with Alice Paul, becoming a member of the Congressional Union’s Advisory Council in 1915 and Vice Chairman of the National Woman’s Party upon its formation in 1916. “The Advisory Council,” *The Suffragist*, vol. 3, no. 5 (January 30, 1915), 2; “Closing Sessions of the Woman’s Party Convention,” *The Suffragist*, vol. 4, no. 25 (June 17, 1916), 5.
- 157 *unsuccessful campaigns*: As a freshman congressman from Manhattan, Hearst ran for president in 1904. In the first year of his second term as a House member he ran for mayor of New York. The following year, still in his second House term, he ran for governor. Three years after leaving the House, he ran unsuccessfully for mayor a second time. His final defeat came in his campaign for New York lieutenant governor in 1910. David Nasaw, *The Chief: The Life of William Randolph Hearst* (New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., 2000), 178–83, 195–213, 223–26. His relationship with Clark dated to his time in Congress. *Ibid.*, 187; Nickliss, *Phoebe Apperson Hearst*, 387.
- 157 *political opportunist*: James D. Startt, *Woodrow Wilson and the Press: Prelude to the Presidency* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2004), 157.
- 157 “*a perfect jackrabbit*”: “Governor Wilson Is A Federalist, Not a Democrat,” *Atlanta Journal*, March 17, 1912, 6; “Wilson Not Making Friends with Publishers,” *Leavenworth Post*, March 19, 2; “No Democrat, This,” *Washington Post*, March 14, 1912, 1.
- 157 *anti-immigrant prejudices*: Nasaw, *The Chief*, 242–43, 551.
- 157 *Wilson’s own words*: Startt, *Wilson and the Press*, 160.
- 157 “*a positive danger*”: *Ibid.*, 158.
- 157 *ten-page feature*: *Ibid.*, 159.
- 157 “*widen his understanding*”: *Ibid.*, 160.
- 158 “*baser elements*”: “Hearst Declared Democratic Issue,” *San Francisco Call*, April 27, 1912, 11.
- 158 “*shifless classes*”: *PWW*, 24:405–06.

- 158 “do not blend”: R. E. Hennings, “James D. Phelan and the Woodrow Wilson Anti-Oriental Statement of May 3, 1912,” *California Historical Society Quarterly*, vol. 42, no. 4 (December 1963), 297.
- 158 *nationally influential*: Hayward “Woody” Farrar, “Black Press,” in Paul Finkelman, ed., *Encyclopedia of African American History, 1896 to the Present* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), 1:231–41, at 236; Startt, *Wilson and the Press*, 89.
- 158 “turn of the finger”: “Wilson and the Negro,” editorial, *New York Age*, July 11, 1912, 4.
- 159 “closes its doors”: Ibid.
- 159 “darky” stories: News Report of a Campaign Speech in Phillipsburg, New Jersey, October 22, 1910, *PWW*, 21:390–91.
- 159 “no use for the Negro”: “Wilson and the Negro,” editorial, *New York Age*, July 11, 1912, 4.
- 159 *Villard conceded*: Oswald Garrison Villard, “The President and the Segregation at Washington,” *North American Review*, vol. 198, no. 697 (December 1913), 800–07, at 801.
- 159 *Socialist Party*: Nicholas Patler, *Jim Crow and the Wilson Administration* (Boulder: University Press of Colorado, 2004), 33.
- 159 “discharged without honor”: John D. Weaver, *The Brownsville Raid* (New York: W. W. Norton and Co., 1970). Unlike a dishonorable discharge, a “discharge without honor” required no military trial. In 1972, President Richard Nixon granted honorable discharges and a pension of \$25,000 to each of the dishonored troops. “Army’s Honorable Discharge Comes—67 Years Late,” *Los Angeles Times*, April 19, 1973, 3; Garna L. Christian, “The Brownsville, Texas, Disturbance of 1906 and the Politics of Justice,” *Trotter Review*, vol. 18, no. 1 (Autumn 2008/Winter 2009), 23–28, at 27.
- 160 *too passive*: A year before the 1912 campaign, Roosevelt—perhaps playing to his immediate audience—wrote a suffrage opponent that “I am rather in favor of the suffrage, but very tepidly.” Elting E. Morison, ed., *The Letters of Theodore Roosevelt*, vol. 7 (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1954), 595.
- 160 “Women’s Roosevelt Leagues”: “Women Thanked for Roosevelt’s Victory,” *San Francisco Bulletin*, May 16, 1912, 11; “Roosevelt Wins Republican Primary in the State,” *San Francisco Chronicle*, May 15, 1912, 1; “Roosevelt Sweeps the City and Captures the State,” *Los Angeles Times*, May 15, 1912, 1; “Taft Out of It in California,” *New York Times*, September 5, 1912, 3; “No Taft Vote,” *Fresno Evening Herald*, October 7, 1912, 4; “Figures by Districts on Tuesday’s Primaries,” *Los Angeles Times*, May 16, 1912, 2.
- 160 *nine of the thirteen: Presidential Elections 1789–2004* (Washington, DC: CQ Press, 2005), 48, 104; Geoffrey Cowan, *Let the People Rule: Theodore Roosevelt and the Birth of the Presidential Primary* (New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 2016), 1; Lewis L. Gould, “1912 Republican Convention: Return of the Rough Rider,” *Smithsonian Magazine*, August 2008 (online).
- 160 *108 votes shy*: Donald R. Deskins, Jr., Hanes Walton, Jr., and Sherman C. Puckett, *Presidential Elections, 1789–2008—County, State, and National Mapping of Election Data* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2010), 296. Other press accounts gave Roosevelt 411 committed votes to Taft’s 201. Lewis L. Gould, *Four Hats in the Ring: The 1912 Election and the Birth of Modern American Politics* (Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2008), 66. The number of delegates needed for nomination was 540. “Taft 566–Roosevelt 466: Present Line-Up of Instructed and Pledged Delegates With All the Contests Decided,” *New York Times*, June 16, 1912, 1.
- 160 *front-page headline*: “Roosevelt A Suffragist,” *New York Times*, June 13, 1912, 1; Corrine M. McConaughy, *The Woman Suffrage Movement in America: A Reassessment* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 239n32. The Bull Moose platform endorsed “equal suffrage to men and women alike” and quoted the Anthony Amendment to condemn denying anyone the ballot “on account of sex.” But it did not state a preference for the state or federal method. According to Roosevelt’s authorized biography, he supported the Anthony Amendment in 1911. Kathleen Dalton, *Theodore Roosevelt: A Strenuous Life* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2002), 612n10.
- 160 *first ballot*: “Taft Renominated by the Republican Convention,” *New York Times*, June 23, 1912, 1.
- 160 *Taft forces began scrambling*: “Illinois Suffragists Distrust Roosevelt; Women Declare They Will Stand by Taft Who Has Long Been Their Friend,” *Tacoma Daily Ledger*, June 23, 1912, 12; “California Women Favor Roosevelt,” *Atlanta Constitution*, June 23, 1912, 3.

- 160 *no role*: This is remarkable given that women had the vote in nine U.S. states at the time. See generally “The Rise of Political Women in the Election of 1912,” chap. 3 in Jo Freeman, *We Will Be Heard: Women’s Struggles for Political Power in the United States* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2008).
- 161 *Tammany initially supported*: Arthur Paulson, *Realignment and Party Revival* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 2000), 49.
- 161 *would have nominated*: Champ Clark, *My Quarter Century in Politics* (New York: Harper & Brothers, 1920), vol. 2, 405.
- 161 *de facto veto*: In a measure of poetic justice, Clark’s son, Joel Bennett Clark, a U.S. senator from Missouri, would preside over the successful vote to repeal the two-thirds rule at the Democratic National Convention in 1936. Bruce J. Schulman, *From Cotton Belt to Sunbelt: Federal Policy, Economic Development, and the Transformation of the South, 1938–1980* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1994), 45.
- 161 *forty-six roll call ballots*: Clark, *My Quarter Century in Politics*, vol. 2, 392. A measure of Clark’s dominance in the primaries was Illinois, where Wilson campaigned heavily and Clark did not even appear. The Democratic vote went for Clark over Wilson by a margin of almost 3 to 1. A. Scott Berg, *Wilson* (New York: G.P. Putnam’s Sons, 2013), 229.
- 161 *two women*: Annie Hamilton Pitzer, *nee* Bennett, Clark’s sister-in-law, was appointed as a member of the Colorado delegation. *Polk County (OR) Observer*, June 28, 1912, 6. The other female delegate was May Arkwright Hutton, a mine owner reputed to be “the richest woman in the West.” Freeman, *We Will be Heard*, 64.
- 162 *flanking the platform ... appeared intimidated*: “Tale of Convention As Told in Flashes: Mrs. Taft Is Guest of Democrats to See Who Will Run Against Her Husband,” *New York Times*, June 28, 1912, 6; “Mrs. Taft at Baltimore Convention to See Husband’s Opponent Nominated,” *Washington Post*, June 28, 1912, 4; “Convention at Work Interests Mrs. Taft,” *New York Sun*, June 28, 1912, 3; “Money Trust Row at Night Session,” *Philadelphia Inquirer*, June 28, 1912, 2; “Mrs. Taft at Convention,” *Buffalo Express*, June 28, 1912, 3; Carl Sferrazza Anthony, *Nellie Taft: The Unconventional First Lady of the Ragtime Era* (New York: William Morrow, 2005), 346–47.
- 162 *“greatest women”*: “Mrs. Taft’s List of Greatest Women,” *New York Times*, December 14, 1911, 6.
- 162 *defeat was inevitable*: Frank Parker Stockbridge, “How Woodrow Wilson Won His Nomination,” *Current History*, vol. 20, no. 4 (July 1924), 561–572, at 571; JPT, *Woodrow Wilson As I Know Him* (Garden City, NY: Doubleday, Page & Co., 1921), 120; *LL*, 3:350.
- 162 *switched his vote*: Stockbridge, “How Woodrow Wilson Won His Nomination,” 571; *LL*, 3:355–56.
- 163 *poll*: *Newark Evening News*, May 17, 1911, cited in *PWW*, 23:113n2. The fact that Wilson was opposed by William Randolph Hearst, the scourge of Tammany’s political bosses, also counted in his favor with the critically important New York delegation. “Wilson Men Always Certain of Victory,” *New York Times*, July 3, 1912, 3.
- 163 *secret promise*: *LL*, 3:362.
- 163 *“distinctly opposed”*: Thomas R. Marshall, *Recollections of Thomas R. Marshall, Vice President and Hoosier Philosopher* (New York: Bobbs-Merrill, 1925), 234–35.
- 163 *Congratulations poured in ... “moral courage”*: *LL*, 3:364–71; “Comment: The Issue Joined,” *Harper’s Weekly*, vol. 56, no. 2899 (July 13, 1912), 4.
- 163 *“an invasion”*: WW to MAHP, July 6, 1912, *PWW*, 24:541.
- 163 *National Independent Political League*: “Colored Citizens Pleased,” *Boston Globe*, November 6, 1912, 13; Nicholas F. Jacobs and Sidney M. Milkis, “Extraordinary Isolation? Woodrow Wilson and the Civil Rights Movement,” *Studies in American Political Development*, vol. 31, no. 2 (October 2017), 193–217, at 194.
- 164 *“unasyllumed maniac”*: John David Smith, “Dixon and His African American Critics,” in *Thomas Dixon Jr. and the Birth of Modern America*, Michelle K. Gillespie and Randall Hall, eds. (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2006), 50.
- 164 *“detrimental to public morals”*: “Negroes War on Dixon—Ask Clergymen to Condemn ‘The Clansman’—Mass Meeting to Be Called,” *New York Times*, December 21, 1905, 5.
- 164 *Black preachers quoted*: “More Hot Shot for T. Dixon,” *New York Times*, December 25, 1905, 3.
- 164 *onstage fireworks*: Fitzhugh Brundage, “American Proteus,” in Gillespie and Hall, *Thomas Dixon Jr. and the Birth of Modern America*, 34.

- 164 *abruptly cancelled*: Fitzgerald, grandfather to John F. Kennedy, leaned on the theater owner, who yielded to “the protests of the Boston negroes” and “the request of Mayor Fitzgerald.” “To Stop the ‘Clansman,’” *Boston Globe* (morning ed.), July 21, 1910, 11; Lehr, *Birth of a Nation*, 85; Mark Schneider, *Boston Confronts Jim Crow, 1890–1920* (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1997), 175.
- 164 “*not in sympathy*”: William Monroe Trotter to WW, July 18, 1912, *PWW*, 24:558.
- 164 “*walking on air*”: “Insult Charge Denied,” *Washington Post*, November 16, 1914, 2. Trotter was joined in the July 16, 1912 meeting by J. Milton Waldron, the white president of the Washington, DC branch of the NAACP. Stephen R. Fox, *The Guardian of Boston, William Monroe Trotter* (New York: Atheneum, 1970), 167.
- 165 “*not a national question*” ... “*it would be best*”: WW to Governor Eugene Noble Foss, August 17, 1912, *PWW*, 25:42 (emphasis added).
- 165 *process could only begin*: New Jersey Constitution of 1844, article IX: Amendments. Nor did Wilson shy away from recommending controversial amendments to the U.S. Constitution in his role as governor. His recommendation that the New Jersey legislature ratify the federal income tax amendment passed by Congress in 1909 met with defeat in New Jersey’s Republican-controlled Senate. John Milton Cooper, Jr., *Woodrow Wilson: A Biography* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2009), 135.
- 166 *Taft’s frustrating straddle*: Taft continued to argue both sides of the question long after the election. See, for example, William H. Taft, “Votes for Women,” *Saturday Evening Post*, vol. 188, no. 11 (September 11, 1915), 3. In this lawyerly piece the former president seemingly makes the case for women voting, but then urges (*a la* Wilson) that later would be better than now.
- 166 *proudly embraced him*: “Opinions of Eminent Persons Against Woman Suffrage,” campaign circulars published by Massachusetts Association Opposed to the Further Extension of Suffrage to Women (1910, 1911, 1912), Massachusetts Historical Society; Hearing on Woman Suffrage, Committee on the Judiciary, U.S. House of Representatives, Serial No. 2 (March 13, 1912), 99 (includes text of January 1912 circular).
- 166 “*to make fools laugh*”: 48 Cong. Rec. pt. 12, 62nd Cong., 2nd Sess., Appendix (June 10, 1912), 354–56 (remarks of Rep. Mondell, quoting his letter to U.S. Rep. Elmer Morse, January 27, 1912).
- 166 “*point of death*”: “Suffragists Again Rouse All England,” *New York Times*, June 30, 1912, 34.
- 167 *six states*: In the 1912 election, the 37 electoral votes of the six suffrage states were as follows: Wyoming 3; Utah 4; Idaho 4; Colorado 6; Washington 7; California 13. Alana S. Jeydel, *Political Women: The Women’s Movement, Political Institutions, the Battle for Women’s Suffrage and the ERA* (New York: Routledge, 2004), Appendix B, 214–15.
- 167 *literally tons*: Martha B. Caldwell, “The Woman Suffrage Campaign of 1912,” *Kansas Historical Quarterly*, vol. 12, no. 3 (August 1943), 312.
- 167 *Maud Wood Park*: That same year, Park was a delegate to Theodore Roosevelt’s Bull Moose national convention. Maud Wood Park biography, Papers of Maud Wood Park, collection overview, Woman’s Rights Collection, Schlesinger Library, Radcliffe Institute, Harvard University.
- 167 *speeches around the state*: Caldwell, “The Woman Suffrage Campaign of 1912,” 312.
- 167 “*cannot escape*”: “Suffrage via Biograph,” *New York Tribune*, June 1, 1912, 3.